TRANSLATION STRATEGIES APPLIED TO CULTURAL WORDS IN CHARLES DICKENS’ A TALE OF TWO CITIES

Haris Syukri¹, Rahmadian Harianti², Yuhendra³, Nofrika Sari⁴, Afdaleni⁵
Sekolah Tinggi Bahasa Asing Haji Agus Salim¹²³⁴⁵
harisyukri@gmail.com¹, rahmadianharianti@stbahas.ac.id², yuhendra28@gmail.com³, nofrikasari81@gmail.com⁴, afdaleni_09@yahoo.com⁵

Abstract

This research sees the translation strategies applied to cultural words in Charles Dickens’s A Tale of Two Cities novel translated by Reinitha Lasmana. This research applied the descriptive qualitative method; collecting the data used the observational method by applying a non-participant observational technique and analyzing the data using the translational method that employs dividing key factors. In analyzing the data, this research applied both theories of Newmark types of cultural words and translation procedures. However, for the translation strategy, the researcher used Venuti’s theories. The findings of this research show three types of cultural words are found in both novels. Secondly, seven procedures are applied in translating selected cultural words. Lastly, it is also found that the most frequent strategy applied by the translator is domestication.

Keywords: Cultural Word, Translation Procedures, Translation Strategy, Charles Dickens’s A Tale of Two Cities
INTRODUCTION

Translation becomes one of the major instruments to spread stories, inventions, and other written works widely. The difference in language cannot be a problem in translation as long as the translator understands both the source and target language. In translating a book, a translator should transfer the message of the source language to the target language. As Bell (Bell & Candlin, 1991, p. 5) said that translation is stating particular ideas in another different language within the equivalent of representation.

This research tried to analyze the strategy that the translator used in translating cultural words in Charles Dickens’s A Tale of Two Cities into Bahasa Indonesia. Thus, it is necessary to identify the categories of cultural words that appeared in the novel, to analyze the procedures applied by the translator to translate cultural words, and to trace the strategy which is used by the translator in translating cultural words.

The translation is an instrumental process in moving the messages from one source language (SL) to a particular target language (TL) by maintaining the equivalences in the target language (TL). Catford defines some types or categories of translation equivalence; extent (full and partial translation), levels of presentation (total and restricted translation – semantics, grammar, lexical), and ranks (word-for-word, phrase-for-phrase, sentence-for-sentence). In addition, Bell (1991, p. 5) also said that translation is stating a particular idea in another different language within a representation of equivalent and emphasizing on preserving semantic and stylistic equivalences.

Larson (1984, p. 2) proposed translation as transferring the meaning from the source language to the target language. According to Larson, translation supposes to study the lexicon, grammatical structure, communication situation, and cultural context of the source language to reconstruct the same meaning. However, culture has become the main barrier to effective and accurate translation (Newmark, 2010, p. 173). A translator must discover the procedures to transfer it to the target language and preserve the equivalent.

Regarding cultural words in novel, they are meant to attract the reader and give a sense of intimacy between the reader and the text. Therefore, most literary works such as novel contain of cultural words. Culture as Newmark (1988, p. 94) highlighted is a way of life that cannot be separated from those who goes along with it that shall be appeared by particular habit,
belief and language. Words bounded by culture are called cultural word. They can be found in the text while associated with a particular language and cannot be translated literally. However, some cultural customs are translated literally to convey the same meaning.

Newmark (1988, p. 95) categorized cultural words which are adopted from Nida as follows; first, ecology. It is cultural term which illustrates geographical features that they are usually value-free, politically and commercially. It includes flora, fauna, winds, plains, hills. Second, material culture (artefacts) is a cultural element such as food, clothes, houses and towns, transportation. Third, social culture that are work and leisure which is social activity contain culture value. Fourth, organizations, customs, ideas; political and administrative, religious, artistic. Usually, the political and social life of a country is reflected in its institutional terms. The last, gesture and habits. There is distinction between description and function that can be made ambiguous.

Newmark’s theory of cultural words has been applied in translation research that investigated cultural words translation strategy used in translating English novel into Bahasa Indonesia. For an instance, Mono et al (2015) analyzed cultural words translation strategies in Animal Farm, a novel written by George Orwell. Newmark’s theory assisted the researcher to identify types of cultural words in both SL and TL of the novel. Another research using Newmark’s theory is conducted by Kuswahono (2020). It investigated cultural words translation technique used on The Da Vinci Code novel from English to Indonesia. Both researches have similarities with this research, which is applying Newmark’s translation theory. However, this research differs from the previous study because it combines Newmark’s theory with Venuti’s.

Generally, a translator uses procedures in charge of translating a text. The researcher in this research adopts the term translation procedures by Newmark (1988, p. 81) which is elaborated on the following; transference (emprunt, loan word, transcription) is a process of transferring an SL word to a TL text. Naturalization is a procedure that adapts the SL word first to the normal pronunciation and then to the normal morphology (word forms) of the TL. Cultural equivalent means replacing a cultural word in the SL with the TL one. Functional equivalent, this common procedure applied cultural words requires using of a culture-free word, sometimes with a new specific term; it, therefore, neutralizes or generalizes the SL word, and sometimes adds a particular.

Descriptive equivalent that is the meaning of the SL word is explained in
several words such as size, color, and composition. Componential analysis procedure compares a SL word with a TL word which has a similar meaning but is not an obvious one-to-one equivalent, by demonstrating first their common and then their differing sense component. Synonymy is only appropriate where literal translation is not possible and because the word is not important enough for componential analysis. Through-translation is the literal translation of common collocations, names of organizations, components of compounds. It is also called: calque or loan translation. Shift or transpositions is a translation procedure that involves a change in the grammar from SL to TL.

Modulation, the term ‘modulation’ defined as ‘a variation through a change of point of view or perspective and category of thought. Recognized translation occurs when the translator normally uses the official or the generally accepted translation of any institutional term. Compensation can occur when loss of meaning in one part of sentence is compensated in another part. Paraphrase is an amplification or explanation of the meaning of a segment of the text. Couplets occur when the translator combines two different procedures. Notes use additional information in a translation. Additional information in translation may take in various forms; within the text, notes at the bottom of the page, notes at the end of the chapter, and notes or glossary at the end of the book.

This strategy was first postulated by German theologian Friedrich Schleiermacher in 1813, then was developed further by Lawrence Venuti (2017, p. 15). The types of translation strategies are: Foreignization, as Venuti highlighted as “an ethnodeviant pressure on those values to register the linguistic and cultural difference of the foreign text, sending the reader abroad.” It means that a target text was produced deliberately to break target conventions by maintaining the foreignness of the original. Domestication, as Venuti stated is “an ethnocentric reduction of foreign text to target-language cultural values, bringing the author back home.” It means emphasizing the transparency by minimizing the foreign word.

METHOD

This research employed the descriptive qualitative method. Hence the data are in words form rather than number and statistics. The researcher uses the descriptive qualitative method when the results are presented in writing. In collecting the data, the researcher employs observational method by applying non participant observational technique. As Sudaryanto (1993, p. 134) said that
“Peneliti tidak terlibat dalam percakapan atau dialog. Peneliti hanya bertindak sebagai pemerhati orang yang sedang berbicara atau bercakap.” Therefore, the researcher does not take part in conversation or dialogue, as act as an observer. In addition, the researcher also uses note-taking technique or teknik catat as proposed by Sudaryanto (1993, p. 135).

The data are collected by following the steps: (a) the researcher reads in both language; A Tale of Two Cities and target language, (b) the data are collected by marking and underlying the cultural words (c) then data are collected and noted on the certain paper. In addition, the data are classified based on the categories (d) finally, for each cultural word that has been classified then categorized based on translation procedures.

In analyzing the data, the researcher uses translational method. According to Sudaryanto (1993, p. 14) “metode translational menggunakan alat penentu languages lain atau bahasa lain yang dijadikan sebagai bahan komparasi dari bahasa yang sedang di teliti.” Furthermore, this research applies dividing key factors or teknik pilah unsur penentu. In this step, the data which has been collected are classified based on particular categories of cultural words, appropriate procedures, and strategy that come up from dominant procedures.

RESULT AND DISCUSSION

The researcher has found data on cultural words taken from an English novel entitled A Tale of Two Cities written by Charles Dickens and the Bahasa Indonesia version with the same title translated by Reinitha Lasmana (2016). The analysis of translation strategy on cultural words found in both novels is described as follows.

Word *stilton* is a cultural word that refers to “traditional English cheese” which belongs to material culture to describe food. *Stilton* is translated into Bahasa Indonesia by using the same word “stilton.” It is indicated for maintaining the original word of that novel. Therefore, the translator applies transference or loan word of procedure to translate this material culture. The translator still mentions *stilton* as if in the English version.

According to the procedure that the translator applied, the strategy of translation can be said as foreignization. *Stilton* still applied in target language to provide foreign flavor. Apart from it, misleading conception is avoided because *Stilton* has no literal translation or its common collocation either. Consequently, the translator keeps the foreignness of this cultural word.

The word *aniseed* belongs to a cultural word which is classified into food or drink (material culture). Word *aniseed* is rendered by the translator into *anisette.*
Based on Collins Dictionary (Dictionary, 2014) word aniseed has meaning the seeds of the anise plant that have a strong smell and taste, used to give flavor to alcoholic drinks. Whereas anisette is a licorice-flavored liqueur made from aniseed. Both are synonymous with each of other but in Newmark theory, there are no procedures that are qualified into it. Anissete is a synonym in the sense of source language not in the target language. That makes this translation not be able to discover by Newmark procedures of theory.

Through the analysis above, it seems that the translator wants to maintain the local color of the author's language even though within a different word. Despite of undefined by Newmark's procedures theory, this kind of translating can be traced through Venuti's theory of translation strategy. So that translating of word aniseed into anisette is claimed as foreignization strategy.

The Captain is a cultural word that refers to social culture. The Captain has a connotative meaning. This word belongs to a social culture that signifies a particular social situation at that age. The Captain is defined by the author to call out highwaymen who sporadically vend in the daylight and rob brutally in the night. And then translator attempts to simplify this word without being senseless. Bajing loncat is chosen by the translator to represent The Captain by considering condition or context in the target language.

The translator tries to translate this word by using a modulation procedure. As Vinay and Darbelnet in Newmark (1988, p. 88) stated that modulation is variation through a change in point of view or perspective and very often of the category of thought. In addition, Newmark also says that modulation has a general concept because it is a superordinate term that covers almost everything beyond the literal translation. He also says that modulation is negated contrary. The translator reproduced the message of the original word with the current norm of the target language. That is why the translator changes The Captain to bajing loncat as it is more understandable by readers in the target language.

Related to the translation strategy, the translator tends to use domestication strategy. Domestication is emphasized by minimizing the foreign language word. The text underlines the target language values. Translator finds out appropriate words to deliver the author’s message in target language. This word the Captain is translated into bajing loncat by translator therefore reader would like to catch up what the writer wants to say.

Citizen refers to a social term. This cultural word is translated by a translator into Citoyen. The word Citoyen is not originally from Bahasa Indonesia however
it belongs to French. Reinitha Lasmana as translator put at the bottom of the page a note that explains about *Citoyen*. She writes additional information “Untuk menekankan kesetaraan derajat, para patriot revolusi memakai sapaan ‘Citoyen’ (dan ‘Citoyenne’ bagi wanita) yang bermakna ‘warga negara’.” In this case, *Citoyen* is not an equivalent term citizen in Bahasa Indonesia thus it cannot be analyzed by Newmark procedure.

Newmark's theory of translation procedure cannot provide an exposition related to this *citizen* change into *citoyen*. Although this translation can be comprehended by additional information at the bottom of the page, the translator's preference to select *citoyen* as the equivalent of *citizen* is not supposed to make sense. Despite of unidentified translation by Newmark procedure, it can be said that this translation is developed by foreignization strategy.

*Hilary Term and Michaelmas* are included in the historical term. This *Hilary Term and Michaelmas* are rendered by Reinitha Lasmana become to *termin Hilary hingga termin Michaelmas*. In this case, she applies the couplets procedure which combines through-translation and note as well. As the result, the translator translates this cultural word literally and then carries forward additional information at the bottom of the page. That explanation of *termin Hilary hingga termin Michaelmas* is in form of “Dalam tradisi hukum Inggris, satu tahun dibagi menjadi empat termin / masa kerja, diawali dengan termin Hilary (Januari – April), diakhiri dengan termin Michaelmas (Oktober – Desember).

Such translator choice emphasizes the Indonesian taste in the translation. It seems by applying couplets combines through-translation and note simultaneously. It uses a domestication strategy where Indonesian nuance goes into it. By combining two procedures it may be taken by the reader clearly and misleading can be avoided as well.

Word *Mam’selle* belongs to a cultural word that refers to a traditional address (idea). *Mam’selle* is originally a French word as well as the author states in his novel. Then the translator transferred it into the target language becomes *Mademoiselle*. This word *Mademoiselle* is basically from the English language. According to the translation procedure that Newmark proposed, this kind of translation cannot be identified by them. It is caused *Mademoiselle* is not the proper equivalent of the source language in Bahasa Indonesia.

Looking the result of analysis above, the translator wants to emphasize that the strategy of translation is more foreign. Instead of transferring to the target language, translator changes word *Mam’selle* to another foreign language.
Even though this translating cannot be qualified by procedures of translation but strategy of translation should be able to trace it. It seems that this translating applied foreignization strategy.

Word *two testaments* is classified as cultural word which refers to religion term. Word *two testaments* is rendered into *Alkitab*. This cultural word is translated by the translator using synonymy procedure. It can be seen that synonymy occurs when there is no clear one-to-one equivalent. *Two testaments* is the Christian Bible which has two parts whereas *Alkitab* is defined as Christian religion text as general. When translator cannot find precise equivalent in target language one-way solution is looking for another appropriate synonym with a similar context.

Through synonymy procedure that translator applied, it can be mentioned that translator tends to do domestication strategy. By changing *two testaments* into *Alkitab* in target language comes up little more of sense Bahasa Indonesia as target language. Reader may gain the meaning as well. Translation which employed synonymy localizes the words.

Word *Convulsionists* belongs to a cultural word that classified into religion term. *Convulsionist* is rendered into *convulsionnaires* translator. *Convulsionist* is the original term in author’s language however translator then changed it to French in target language (*convulsionnaires*). The procedure of translation purposes by Newmark might not discover this kind of translating due to in Newmark’s theory there is no other foreign language equivalent unless source language itself. Moreover, the translator annotates additional information at the bottom of the page as follows: *Sekte kebatinan yang berkembang di Prancis pada awal abad ke-18, disebut juga Convulsionnaires de Saint-Médard*. As the result, this translation of cultural words goes to the undefined procedure of Newmark theory.

Related to the strategy, the cultural word *Convulsionists* that is transferred to *convulsionnaires* is confusing. The translator mixed altogether source language and target language. Newmark theories of procedures are not supposed to analyze this kind of translation as well. Consequently, the strategy of translation also cannot be traced because specifically this regional term might go to both foreignization and domestication and this theory should not be able to cover it all together as well.

Word *Carmagnole* belongs to the cultural word which is classified as an artistic term. *Carmagnole* is traditional dancing at France Revolution. The translator borrows this artistic term into Bahasa Indonesia. Furthermore, the translator adds information at the bottom of the page. In this case, the translator
involves two procedures; transference and note thus it is called a couplet. Translator states the exploration statement into note as it is “Carmagnole diambil dari nama busana petani Desa Carmagnola di Piemonte, Italia. La Carmagnole menjadi judul lagu dan nama tarian revolusioner yang sangat popular pada masa Revolusi Prancis.”

As analysis above points out that word Carmagnole is purely borrowed by translator into target language. Furthermore, the translator brings some information related to the word Carmagnole in note form. Based on this procedure that the translator used, it can be concluded that the translator borrows this artistic term then taking a comprehension note in order to reader’s side as well as vision of domesticating. The point is, this translation strategy goes to domestication strategy.

CONCLUSION

Based on the finding and discussion, conclusions are formulated as follows. This research found three out of five types of cultural words proposed by Newmark. The types are organizations, customs, and ideas (political, social, concept, religious, artistic), which are the most frequent category of the cultural word in the novel, with around 22 data. Then is followed by material culture (artifacts), which is seen in 7 data, and the last one is the social culture that has been found in 2 data in the novel.

Concerning the second research question, from fifteen items of procedures that Newmark proposed, the most frequently employed procedure is through-translation which is applied in 8 data, followed by transference which is applied in 7 data, continues to synonymy in 4 data, couplets in also 4 data, naturalization in 2 data, modulation and compensation are the infrequent procedure that translator used. In this case, the researcher found 4 unidentified procedures that the translator applied in translating the cultural words. The procedures Newmark proposed cannot analyze them.

Regarding the third research question, generally, the translator tends to apply a domestication strategy in translating cultural words in Charles Dickens’s A Tale of Two Cities. It indicates that the translator wants the reader to comprehend easily by bringing the cultural word into the target language. As consideration, domestication appears around 18 times under procedures of through-translation, synonymy, couplets, and compensation whereas foreignization appears around 12 times under procedures, transference, and naturalization. In this case, the researcher found a problem, that is, there is a strategy which is existing
between foreignization and domestication so the researcher states it as unidentified by Venuti theory.

REFERENCE


https://books.google.co.id/books?id=YFq4CwAAQBAJ


